OPERATIONAL EXCELLENCE MODEL TO ACHIEVE CITIZEN SATISFACTION SERVICES IN ABU DHABI POLICE USING STRUCTURE EQUATION MODEL (SMART-PLS)

¹ABDULLA EBRAHIM SAYYAR ALMANSOORI, ²JUHAINI BINTI JABAR and ³AMIR BIN ARIS

^{1,2,3}Institute of Technology Management and Entrepreneurship, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka, Hang Tuah Jaya, 76100 Durian Tunggal, Melaka, Malaysia
¹<u>p061820019@student.utem.edu.my</u>, ²<u>juhaini@utem.edu.my</u>, ³<u>amir.aris@utem.edu.my</u>
Corresponding Author: <u>juhaini@utem.edu.my</u>

ABSTRACT

Organizations in UAE have continued to deploy huge investments in operational excellence strategies and training of manpower to handle the new strategies. In the recent years the number of organizations in UAE has improved rivalry. It is therefore important to establish how public organizations in UAE are benefiting from the operational excellence strategies they are implementing. Nowadays, achieving operational excellence is a requirement to the organizations. In order to increase the performance and be competitive, organizations are giving more attention to achieve the higher levels of operational performance. This scenario has influence 80% to 90% to implement the operational excellence program. Unfortunately, only 30% of the companies achieve their expected results. This is because many organizations have not found a better management system that company can use to manage its operations in order to achieve operational excellence. In order to achieve the excellence results, an effective management system is highly needed in the organization. However, insufficient studies done on operational excellence in UAE focused on the Abu Dhabi police sector with regards to citizen satisfaction services. Therefore, this study aimed to fill this gap by developing operational excellence model to achieve citizen satisfaction services in Abu Dhabi police sector. In this research, the populations are employees in Abu Dhabi police, civil defence, ambulance, fire services and border security based on five constructs which are Operational Excellence, Leadership Support, Technical Proficiency, Project Planning and Execution and Corporate Culture. The results found that there are positive relationship and significant between the Leadership Support, Project Planning, Technical Proficiency, Corporate Culture and citizen satisfactions. On the other hand, the path relationship between Corporate Culture and Citizen Satisfaction shows a negative significant path relationship. There is also negative relationship between Operational Excellence and Corporate Culture in path model. The policy implication of the research is to awaken government in general and ministry of interior in particular from the slumber of implementation of reliable approach to tackle accidents and criminals. Furthermore, this model can be applying to Abu Dhabi police under the responsibility of the police sector to ensure that it operates effectively and efficiently, it cooperates with local, national and international organizations to ensure the enforcement of laws in the latter safeguard public safety and maintain law and order. The Abu Dhabi Police might focus on mitigating these effects, which would be a great starting point for future research.

Keywords: Abu Dhabi police.Operational Excellence, Leadership Support, Technical Proficiency, Project Planning and Execution and Corporate Culture, Smart PLS.

1. Introduction

McLean, &Dahlgaard, (2017) indicated that during the global downturn of 2009, many businesses cut costs and boosted efficiencies to survive. They sought to increase their profitability through cost-cutting and efficiency strategies. Therefore, a number of them adopted operational excellence by making savvy business choices about operating structures as well as about execution to enhance their future success. OE is a policy extremely used by companies investing into international markets to get a competitive advantage (Jaeger et al., 2016). However, not many firms have successfully implemented it owing to lack of skilled personnel to guide the strategy implementation. This means that any firm intending to adopt and implement OE has to invest in human resources skilled in this concept. The fact that only few companies have executed OE concludes that there is deficiency of firms to serve as models to those that would wish to implement OE (Fok-Yew, 2018).

Organizations in UAE have continued to deploy huge investments in operational excellence strategies and training of manpower to handle the new strategies. In the recent years the number of organizations in UAE has improved rivalry. It is therefore important to establish how public organizations in UAE are benefiting from the operational excellence strategies they are implementing.

Nowadays, achieving operational excellence is a requirement to the organizations. In order to increase the performance and be competitive, organizations are giving more attention to achieve the higher levels of operational performance. This scenario has influence 80% to 90% to implement the operational excellence program. Unfortunately, only 30% of the companies achieve their expected results. This is because many organizations have not found a better management system that company can use to manage its operations in order to achieve operational excellence. In order to achieve the excellence results, an effective management system is highly needed in the organization.

Moreover, today's competitive and market conditions have forced the organization to seek long term success by achieving excellence in the business. However, how to achieve the operational excellence and sustain competitive advantages are the fundamental questions among the organizations (Al Shobaki, & Abu-Naser, 2017). Many organizations are seeking the excellence performance in order to be competitive in the business. One of the ways to achieve the excellence result is by using the improvement initiatives and tools such as excellence model. Unfortunately, many of them have failed to gain the benefits from the improvements initiatives and could not achieve the excellence level due to the lack of clear understanding and appropriate guidelines regarding what, where and how to implement improvements initiatives to achieve the excellence results. Additionally, the practitioners require practical and detailed guidance to achieve the nature of excellence are still unclear and such implementations have followed a trial-and-error approach (Fok-Yew et al., 2017).

However, organizational excellence plays a very vital role in organizational sector of many countries by helping in citizen satisfaction, this is of course a very vital role

played. Similarly, police sectors of many countries missed to employed organizational excellence in their day-to-day activities, which harmed the citizen of police sector. Abu Dhabi police too has issues with regard to operational excellence in which many people complained about the poor attendance/services received by Abu Dhabi police, this tremendously affects the police sector of Abu Dhabi UAE. The main problem of Abu Dhabi police sector with regards to operational excellence according to Khairi, (2016) is lack of training among the personnel of the Abu Dhabi police, this tremendously affect the citizen satisfaction of the Abu Dhabi police sector.

Several studies have been conducted on operational excellence; Vaddeswaram, (2018) investigated design for six sigma; Soares& Liao, (2017) investigated on total quality management in the manufacturing sector; Cojocaru, & Miller, (2016) did a study on achieving operational excellence in the financial sector and surveyed total quality management in secondary schools; while Tornjanski&Jancic, (2017) studied enhancement of operational excellence in the retail service workshop processes in General Motors East Africa Limited. The main focus of this research is to develop new operation excellence model that will help in achieving citizen satisfaction services in Abu Dhabi Police. The main relation between this research and operational excellence is the main role OE play in helping organization (Abu Dhabi police) to achieve citizen satisfaction services.

However, insufficient studies done on operational excellence in UAE focused on the Abu Dhabi police sector with regards to citizen satisfaction services. Therefore, this study aimed to fill this gap by developing operational excellence model to achieve citizen satisfaction services in Abu Dhabi police sector

2. Literature Review

Citizen satisfaction has been defined as pleasurable or positive emotional state, resulting from the appraisal of one's job or job experiences (Locke 1976), and its research has dominated the field of human resources management and organizational behavior for a long time (Rainey 2003). Being one of the most widely used theories of citizen satisfaction, Locke's Range Theory (1976) points out two main aspects for citizen satisfaction, which are what an employee wants from the citizen and what experiences gets from the job. If expectations are far from the experiences, a person will have low citizen satisfaction, whereas the more they coincide, the higher the feeling of satisfaction from the citizen performed. While the idea in itself is not new, the main detail that Locke (1976) added is that in the same work conditions employees can be equally satisfied or unsatisfied, simply because of what they value as important citizen experience. For some it can be citizen security, for others friendly work environment, person-job fit, etc. Thus, whether someone is satisfied with her citizen depends on a wide set of determinants (Spector 1997), and as expected from Locke's (1976) perspective Some studies report contradictory findings for almost any of these antecedent (Rainey 2008).

In the police research, studies reveal that intrinsic citizen satisfaction is a stronger predictor of turnover intensions than extrinsic (Brough and Frame 2004). Also, studies point out cultural values and norms as important determinants of citizen

satisfaction across countries (Howes and GoodmanDelahunty 2014). The overall trend is that intrinsic job factors related to the nature of the work itself are more important to employees in Western developed countries than those in developing countries (Abdulla et al. 2011). citizen satisfaction derived from public service motivation found in developed countries would correspond to Locke's proposition that people with high motivation to serve will find that work in public service matches their expectations and prospected experiences. Empirical evidence confirms strong association between public service motivation and citizen satisfaction in various public service settings (Taylor 2014). Also, the evidence of this relationship has been established with public servants outside civil service (Kim 2011) and within the general population (Taylor 2011).

A critical note by Dantzker and Surrette (1996) alarmed a lack of comprehensive citizen satisfaction research in the police field. Since then, more scholars have been choosing this subject as a focus of their inquiry. The police studies conducted to date have primarily focused on individual demographics or organizational variables to explain the citizen satisfaction levels (Hassell et al. 2011). However, the link between citizen satisfaction and motivation has been rarely tested (see White et al. 2010 for exceptions and the detailed review). Yet, more studies are suggesting that the public service work environment of policing jobs is related to the job satisfaction of the officers. For instance, Raganella and White (2004) pointed out altruistic and practical motives as well as a motivations remain stable over time (White et al. 2010).

2.1 Challenges of Operational Excellence Implementation

Challenges are faced by different organizations from different sectors of the economy. OE challenges "are not farfetched from management readiness to change the process of work, employee's commitment and engagement (Fork-Yew & Ahmad, 2014), resources, and professional expertise in risk management, especially in the police (Heath *et al.*, 2017; Franke & Weber, 2017). Other challenges are related to process automation using recent information technologies and regulations governing operations. Equally ownership, specifically government involvement in NOCs operations causes a lot of compromises due to political pressures (Hartley & Medlock, 2012).

Brown (2012) identified vital challenges to sustaining business excellence amongst esteemed companies in Australia. According to Brown these challenges comprised of strategy, leadership support, people, process, data and information, and citizens. Through understanding the innate challenges related to operational excellence and more conspicuously, the critical success dynamics and skills needed to overcome the challenges is having a culture of continuous improvement (Tennant, 2002). In a separate development Brown (2012) also suggested that future research could consider different stages in the process of pursuing business excellence, for example, implementation, development, maturity and sustainability.

In a recent study, de Waal, (2013) studied evergreen factors that are critical to achieving sustained excellence over time. These factors are often not found in many organizations. Consequently, their absence is a serious challenge to the implementation of the OE program in many" organizations. They are comprised of structural design, procedure, strategy, technology, leadership, individuals and roles, culture, and external orientation. Although the factors may evolve, nonetheless, they are always critical for building and sustaining a high-performance organization (FokYew& Ahmad, 2014; Bharadwaj*et al.*, 2017). Because of their importance, these factors need to be provided by organizations so also the enabling environment. With them, operations and all functions of the organization could be improved to world-class performance standards. Some of the highlighted challenges of OE were researched and improved by earlier empirical studies, which would be discussed in the subsequent section of the study. Therefore, this research work focuses on the employing operational excellence in achieving citizen satisfaction in Abu Dhabi Police.

3. Underpinning theories in this study

Researcher recognize that studies exist that emphasize the differences between organizational learning frameworks and theories (Crossan, Maurer & White, 2011). Although there are questions about OL theory to answer, researcher practice the word "theory" to designate which organizations must dominate effective OL. Though the previous literature provided a multiple theoretical perspective on organizational learning (Jerez-Gómez & Perez-Valls, 2019). Researcher look at selected perspectives to reach a valued exchange amid representativeness and indepth analysis, which applies to our research. Since the goal is to present an illustrative set of theories and everyone has its strengths and weaknesses, researcher advocate including the designated theory because it is groundbreaking and affects organizational learning and organizational excellence instead of defending organizational theory. Researcher have no intention of demeaning the theory we choose. Instead, the goal is a set of representative theories covering the fields of operational excellence factors on citizen satisfaction services in Abu Dhabi police. Because of its groundbreaking nature and its huge impact of operational excellence factors on citizen satisfaction services in Abu Dhabi police. The researcher has chosen a few theories. This research is based on a resource-based view, knowledge base view and organizational development theory (Ouma, K. Obonyo and Yabs, 2017). However, these theories are most often mentioned in the literature analyzed, and the relevance of these theories is discussed in the next section.

1.1 Resource-Based View (RBV)

The company's Resource-Based View (RBV) or vision of internal competitive advantage stems from the bias in the early 1980s regarding interior resources and competencies as the main foundation of competition. Barney (1991) and Wernerfelt (1984) advanced resource-based theories about the company's internal capabilities and led concentration in strategic management within the company.

According to RBV, competitive gain is centered on the company's valued and unique assets. This perception assumes companies to contest on the basis of their internal abilities, capabilities, and uniqueness or unique resource competences (Hoskisson et al., 1999).

The company's ability or capability, as well as its management capabilities to collect resources and its implementation model for achieving high performance, regulate their competitive advantage (Grant, 1991). Barney (1991) also pointed out that by developing the company's resources and internal capabilities and relating it to the suitable peripheral environment in a well-timed manner, companies can progress feasible and sustainable strategies. In the study, McEvily and Charkravathy (2002) conducted a research and proved that if a company can continuously acquire, adapt and offer distinctive requirements in a way that cannot be instantly imitative, then they can overcome opponents. The company's capability to adopt organizational learning in an appropriate way is an imperative internal resource that assists the company successful image ahead of the competition and takes appropriate action based on changes in the environment.

1.2 Knowledge-Based View (KBV)

Knowledge-based views (KBV) are extensions of resource-based views. It enhances the key part of internal resources and emphases on distinguished knowledge stocks as the base for competitive gain (Hoskisson et al., 1999). Knowledge-based view scholars regard knowledge as a strategic source and knowledge collection as a strategic capacity booster (Conner, 1991; Grant, 1996; Kogut and Zander, 1993; Leonard-Barton, 1992; Liebaskind, 1996; Spender and Grant, 1996; Akbar et al., 2021).

A company's understanding of procedures and developments that describe unique ways of working within an organization, and a thoughtful of consumer needs and supplier strength is the foundation of organizational excellence (Grant, 1991). The generally accepted interpretation in the strategic management research is that performance dissimilarities among organizations are due to their diverse knowledge reserves and their ability to develop and deploy knowledge (Choo and Bontis, 2002). The vibrant setting in which the company is currently has aroused strong interest in the continuous learning and knowledge collection of the organization, and the ability to make timely, informed decisions about the necessary changes needed to maintain the level of citizen satisfaction (Sanchez (1995).

1.3 Organizational Development Theory ODT)

The Organizational Development Theory (ODT) proposed by Lewin (1951) clearly emphasizes the practice and academics of planned organizational change. Lewin's work helps show that feedback is a valuable tool for improving performance (excellence). Lewin's theory of organizational development is very valuable, and it shows that organizational change has three steps, namely defrost, transformation and deicing. In the first step, the organization recognizes the need for change.

During the transformation, organizational development will change, and in the final step, the implemented changes will be frozen again in the organizational routine. ODT is committed to aligning an organization with its complex environment, which changes rapidly over leadership support, ingrained in company strategy, technical proficiency and project planning execution, and then mediating variable (MV) of corporate culture and the alteration of citizen satisfaction and standards into a superior organization that will ultimately make the organization successful (Cummings, 2004).

4. Research Methodology

This research purely quantitative method the questionnaire survey to developing operational excellence model to achieve citizen satisfaction services in Abu Dhabi police. The total number of the employees are 36,000. A total number of 250 questionnaires were administered across citizens in Abu Dhabi. From this number, a total of 192 questionnaires representing 76.8 percent of the total questionnaires administered were retrieved. Out of this number, a total of 13 questionnaires were either partially filled or invalidated as a result of wrongful filling. Thus, therefore resulted in the total number of 179 valid questionnaires which were used for analyses. This is considered effective sample appropriate to give meaningful responses which can be relied upon and is considered sufficient sample size to meet the requirement of sample size for the chosen analytical tool. The analysis of data using appropriate statistical techniques statistical package for social sciences (SPSS) and structural equation modelling (PLS-SEM,) as the research is quantitative in nature.

5. Partial Least Square (PLS) Regression

Partial Least Square (PLS) was employed to test the research hypothesis. It involved determining the influence of exogenous latent constructs on the endogenous latent construct. Chin (2002) and Wong (2013), recommended the assessment of convergent validity and discriminant validity of the outer (measurement) model before the assessment of the inner (structural) model. The criteria for measuring the outer and inner models are based on different standards mention in different journal papers.

Table 1: presents the existing criteria used in the assessment and validation of measurement and structural models in PLS-SEM analysis

Criterion Measurement model assessment	Description	Acceptable/Recommended Threshold
Indicator reliability	Measures the variance explained by the observed variables towards underlying latent construct	value≥0.708 (Hair et al., 2014)
Cronbach's Alpha	Measures the indicators uni- dimensionality (inter-correlation) with their latent construct	α≥0.70 (Oyer,, 2007; Hair et al., 2010)
Composite reliability	It is a measure of internal consistency	p _c > 0.70 (Nunally&Berntein, 1994; Hair et al., 2010)
Average Variance Extracted (AVE)	Average percentage of variation explained among the items of a construct	AVE > 0.50 (Fornell&Larcker, 1981)
Fornell-Larcker Criterion	Measures the degree to which two conceptually similar concepts are distinct (in such a way that each latent variable shares more variance with its own block of indicators than with another latent variable)	√AVE > Latent variables correlations (Fornell&Larcker, 1981)
Cross-loadings	A situation where a variable has two or more factor loadings exceeding the threshold value deemed necessary for inclusion in the factor interpretation process	Variable loading on an two or more factors at > 0.40
Heterotrait- monotrait (HTMT) ratio of correlations	Measures the degree to which two conceptually similar concepts are distinct (in such a way that each latent variable shares more variance with its own block of indicators than with another latent variables)	Correlation between any pair of construct should be < HTMT. ₈₅ (Henseler, Ringle, &Sarstedt, 2015)
Collinearity	Measures the relationship between two or more independent variables	VIF < 5 is considered mild case of collinearity
R ² (Coefficient of Determination)	Amount of variance explained in endogenous latent variable by all exogenous latent variable in structural model	$R^2 = 0.20$ is considered high in consumer behavior studies (Hair et al., 2014) $R^2 = 0.25$, 0.50, 0.75 are considered weak, moderate, and substantial respectively in (Hair, Ringle&Sarstedt, 2011)

		considered weak, moderate and substantial (Chin, 1998)
B coefficient	Standardized regression coefficient that allows for a direct comparison between coefficients as to their relative explanatory power of independent variable	Higher magnitude indicates more explanatory power
Effect Size f^2	The measure of relative impact of exogenous latent construct on the endogenous construct	f^2 = 0.02, 0.15 and 0.35 are considered small, medium and large respectively (Cohen, 1998)

6. Evaluation of Measurement Model

The theoretical framework of this research contains six main constructs. Construct validity shows the extent to which the respective indictors represent their underlying latent variables. In addition, to establish construct validity, the indicators in the measurement model have to meet up the requirement for convergent and discriminant validity. Convergent validity measures the extent to which indicators of the same concept are correlated while discriminant validity measures the degree of uniqueness of a construct in relation to other constructs (Hair *et al.*, 2014; Yeap, Ramayah, & Soto-Acosta, 2016).

The relationship between all the constructs with their respective indicators was reflective. The recommended practice for assessing reflective measurement model is to assess the construct validity of the indicators of each construct in the model (Hair *et al*, 2014). For reflective models, however, the recommended practice for measurement model evaluation involves assessing the outer weights and collinearity issue in the model in order to establish construct validity (Hair *et al.*, 2014).

7. Validity and Reliability

The recommendation for assessing convergent validity involves meeting the criteria for indicator reliability by examining the indicator loadings, composite reliability, and the average variance extracted (AVE) and comparing the values with the recommended thresholds as shown in Table 1. For a construct to achieve convergent validity, the literature recommended the values of 0.7 and above for both indicator loading and composite reliability and 0.5 and above for AVE (Hair, *et al*, 2014; Akbar et al., 2020). On the other hand, discriminant validity is assessed by examining the cross-loadings, the Fornell-Larcker criterion and the Heterotrait-Monotrait (HTMT) ratio of correlations (Ali, Kim, &Ryu, 2016; Hair *et al.*, 2014; Henseler, Ringle, &Sarstedt, 2015). Figure 2shows the measurement model indicating the factor loadings of the various indicators on the respective latent constructs in the research model.

8. Convergent validity

Table 2, shows the loadings of the respective indicators on their respective constructs of the research model. As shown in Table 2, all the loadings meet the recommended 0.7 threshold except for two items. The lowest loading is ranging from 0.685 to 0.687. The researcher retained those items on the recommendations of Hair et al., (2014), if the AVE is achieved then lowest items can be retained. While the AVE highest loading is 0.697 which is associated with the Leadership Support construct. This shows that the indicators of each construct were highly correlated with their respective construct thus indicative of convergent validity.



Figure1: Measurement Model

Table 2: Convergent Validity of Measurement Model

	Corporate Culture	Citizen Satisfaction	Leadership Support	Operational Excellence	Project Planning & Execution	Technical Proficiency
CC1	0.753					
CC2	0.773					
CC3	0.571					
CC4	0.687					
CC5	0.753					
CS1		0.797				
CS2		0.864				
CS3		0.879				
CS4		0.861				
CS5		0.808				
CS6		0.701				
CS7		0.801				
CS8		0.740				
LS1			0.799			
LS2			0.824			
LS3			0.914			
LS4			0.720			
LS5			0.903			
OE2				0.539		
OE3				0.880		
OE4				0.832		
OE5				0.770		
OE6				0.867		
PPE1					0.790	
PPE2					0.744	
PPE3					0.758	
PPE4					0.782	
PPE5					0.805	
TP1						0.809
TP2						0.711
TP3						0.650
TP4						0.804
TP5						0.738

To further verify the convergent validity of the measurement model, further analysis to determine the composite reliability and the AVEs of the latent constructs was conducted. Table 3 shows the composite reliability and the AVEs of the constructs in the research model. As indicated by the result, the composite reliability values, which measures the extent to which the indicators depict the latent construct, all reported values higher than the recommended minimum threshold of 0.7. Similarly, the reported AVEs showed that all values meet the minimum threshold of 0.5 (Hair *et al.*, 2014). Therefore, the requirement for convergent validity was achieved.

	Cronbach's Alpha	Composite Reliability	Average Variance Extracted (AVE)
Corporate Culture	0.759	0.835	0.506
Citizen Satisfaction	0.924	0.938	0.654
Leadership Support	0.889	0.920	0.697
Operational Excellence	0.841	0.888	0.620
Project Planning & Execution	0.836	0.883	0.602
Technical Proficiency	0.802	0.861	0.555

Table 4: Reliability Measurement Model

Discriminant Validity

Table 4 shows the discriminant validity result using the Fornell-Larcker criterion. Based on this criterion discriminant validity is said to be achieved when the square root of the AVE of the construct of interest is greater than any correlation between the construct and other constructs in the model (Ali, Kim &Ryu, 2016). As shown in the Table 5, the diagonal values which represent the square root of the AVE of each construct are higher than the inter-correlations between other constructs in the model, thus satisfying the discriminant validity criterion.

Table 5: Fornell-Larcker criterion

	Corporate Culture	Citizen Satisfaction	Leadership Support	Operational Excellence	Project Planning & Execution	Technical Proficiency
Corporate Culture	0.711					
Citizen Satisfaction	0.706	0.808				
Leadership Support	0.701	0.801	0.835			
Operational Excellence	0.619	0.805	0.822	0.787		
Project Planning & Execution	0.698	0.683	0.678	0.626	0.776	
Technical Proficiency	0.708	0.780	0.801	0.715	0.733	0.745

In addition, to further verify the attainment of discriminant validity, the cross loading approach were also applied. Chin, (1998), was the one who propose the cross-loading criterion. Items must load greater on its latent construct than their cross-loading other construct, according to the criteria set by Chin, (1998). An element must load more on actual construct than it does on anyone else constructs and rows while cross-loadings. The cross-loading methods are seen as progressive, while the Fornell-Larcker measures are considered traditional one. The cross-loadings of all the constructs are shown in **Table 6**. The table demonstrate that the items achieve the maximum loadings on their respective factor. As a result, the discriminant validities are achieved as per the recommended thresholds.

Table 6: Cross-Loadings

	Corporate Culture	Citizen Satisfaction	Leadership Support	Operational Excellence	Project Planning & Execution	Technical Proficiency
CC1	0.753	0.551	0.551	0.487	0.642	0.596
CC2	0.773	0.491	0.503	0.380	0.512	0.569
CC3	0.571	0.240	0.261	0.131	0.306	0.435
CC4	0.687	0.366	0.349	0.351	0.409	0.542
CC5	0.753	0.709	0.740	0.676	0.535	0.683
CS1	0.669	0.797	0.748	0.672	0.616	0.713
CS2	0.566	0.864	0.774	0.786	0.610	0.681
CS3	0.696	0.879	0.841	0.734	0.596	0.782
CS4	0.621	0.861	0.784	0.813	0.645	0.736
CS5	0.531	0.808	0.734	0.545	0.511	0.549
CS6	0.433	0.701	0.569	0.464	0.442	0.420
CS7	0.541	0.801	0.693	0.503	0.477	0.563
CS8	0.460	0.740	0.637	0.613	0.481	0.518
LS1	0.584	0.697	0.799	0.617	0.428	0.585
LS2	0.586	0.811	0.824	0.813	0.650	0.727
LS3	0.638	0.795	0.914	0.717	0.553	0.701
LS4	0.576	0.667	0.720	0.702	0.665	0.608
LS5	0.623	0.778	0.903	0.702	0.535	0.709
OE2	0.245	0.351	0.413	0.539	0.256	0.321
OE3	0.415	0.595	0.642	0.880	0.464	0.516
OE4	0.639	0.725	0.802	0.832	0.513	0.677
OE5	0.482	0.609	0.624	0.770	0.571	0.513
OE6	0.544	0.774	0.773	0.867	0.579	0.682
PPE1	0.507	0.479	0.488	0.470	0.790	0.601
PPE2	0.491	0.474	0.493	0.505	0.744	0.540
PPE3	0.467	0.486	0.505	0.390	0.758	0.487
PPE4	0.593	0.514	0.525	0.472	0.782	0.549
PPE5	0.622	0.664	0.601	0.569	0.805	0.650
TP1	0.702	0.807	0.792	0.681	0.590	0.809
TP2	0.532	0.733	0.766	0.765	0.640	0.711
TP3	0.531	0.322	0.386	0.272	0.449	0.650
TP4	0.666	0.495	0.471	0.423	0.540	0.804
TP5	0.553	0.389	0.432	0.384	0.475	0.738

9. Structural Model Evaluation

In the previous section, it was shown that all the recommended criteria for measurement model validity were satisfied thus accomplishing the first stage of the two-staged PLS-SEM evaluation process. In this section, the second stage of the process is presented. The structural model evaluation is a five-staged process that involves collinearity assessment, significance testing of the structural model relationships, assessment of level of R2, assessment of effect size, and assessment of predictive relevance of the model (Hair *et al.*, 2014). Figure 2 shows the structural model indicating the t-values and p-values of the respective path coefficients and factor loadings.



Figure 2: Structural Model

10. Path Coefficient

The path coefficients are the estimates of the hypothesized relationship between the endogenous latent construct (Citizen Satisfaction) and the exogenous latent constructs (Leadership Support, Operational Excellence, Project Planning & Execution, and Technical Proficiency) and Corporate Culture as a mediation these relationships in the structural model. The strength of the relationship is indicated by the magnitude and significance of the estimates. Path coefficients that are close to +1.96 are considered to represent strong positive relationships while those that tend towards -1.96 are considered to represent strong negative relationships (Hair *et al*, 2014). The significance of the path estimates is determined through the bootstrapping procedure in the Smart PLS-SEM software using the critical t-value for significance testing at 5 percent level of significance.

	Beta	Standard Deviation (STDEV)	T Statistics (O/STDEV)	P Values	f2	R ²
CC -> CS	0.042	0.057	0.736	0.462	0.082	
LS -> CC	0.219	0.092	2.384	0.018	0.734	
LS -> CS	0.653	0.096	6.773	0.000	0.792	
OE -> CC	-0.083	0.068	1.213	0.226	0.791	
OE -> CS	0.111	0.055	2.035	0.042	0.805	0.826
PPE -> CC	0.203	0.053	3.797	0.000	0.137	
PPE -> CS	0.079	0.041	1.919	0.056	0.078	
TP -> CC	0.544	0.082	6.616	0.000	0.082	
TP -> CS	0.086	0.078	1.106	0.269	0.734	

Table 7: Path Coefficient

Table 7 shows the path coefficients (β) with their respective t-values, p-values and f2 values. As shown in the table, six paths show significant positive relationships while three paths show a negative significant relationship. The highest positive significant path relationship was between Leadership Support & Citizen Satisfaction (β =.653, t=6. 773, p< .050) while the least positive significant path relationship was between Project Planning & Execution and Citizen Satisfaction (β =.079, t=1.919, p< .050). Similarly, Technical Proficiency and Corporate Culture reported positive and significant relationship with path estimates of $(\beta = .544, \beta = .544)$ t=6.616, p<.05). The result revealed that Operational Excellence andCitizen Satisfaction is positively influenced results shows as (β =.111, t=2.035, p<.05). On the other hand, the path relationship between Corporate Culture and Citizen Satisfaction shows a negative significant path relationship (β =-.042, t=0.736, p>.05). There is also negative relationship between Operational Excellence and Corporate Culture in path model (β =-.083, t=1.213, p>.05). However, when considered from the questions on the questionnaire, it is clear that the respondents rated highly on the Operational Excellence scales that measured their perceived Citizen Satisfaction which implies that they considered these factors slightly down effect towards the dependent variable of the study in terms of defining the Citizen Satisfaction Services in Abu Dhabi Police.

11. Coefficient of Determination (R²)

The coefficient of determination (R-square) is the global measure of the structural model's predictive accuracy. It is the indication of the combined effects of all the exogenous latent constructs on the endogenous construct on the model. The R-square also represents the amount of variance in the endogenous latent construct explained by all the exogenous latent constructs in the structural model (Hair, et al 2014). The result shown in Table 7 indicated that the entire six exogenous latent constructs in the structural model have significantly high effect on the endogenous latent construct (R2=.826). This shows that the combined effect of the exogenous latent construct. This suggests that Operational Excellence, Leadership Support, Project Planning & Execution, Technical Proficiency, and Corporate Culture collectively predict individual's intentions to take part effectively in describing the Citizen Satisfaction Services in Abu Dhabi Police.

12. Effect size (f 2)

The R-square as an index for measuring overall model performance can be evaluated further in respect of the contribution of individual exogenous constructs that formed the model. The f 2 measures the change in R2 occasioned to the omission of a specific exogenous construct in a model. It is used to assess the impact of individual exogenous construct on the R2 value of the endogenous construct (Hair, *et al.*, 2014). The effect size is measured according to Cohen's (1988) guidelines where f 2 values of .02, .15 and .35 are considered as small, medium and large effects respectively. From **Table 7**, the f2 values of the respective path relationships in the structural model are presented. The results indicate that Operational Excellence have large effect on Citizen Satisfaction with effect sizes of f2=0.805. All other constructs have similarly large effects on the R-square. For Leadership Support, Project Planning & Execution, Technical Proficiency, and Corporate Culture has large effects the f 2= 0.791, 0.792, 0.082 and 0.734 respectively shows values effects on the R-square value.

13. Hypotheses Testing

The hypotheses were tested via the PLS-SEM analysis the result of the test is shown in Table 8. As shown in the table, some of the hypotheses were accepted based on the 95 percent confidence interval. This study had developed seven main hypotheses. The findings shows that four hypotheses were accepted and three hypotheses were not supported. The detail discussion about the previous literature and hypotheses acceptance or rejection are discussed in detail.

The recap of the hypotheses postulated are as follows:

H1: Leadership Support is positively associated with citizen satisfaction

H2: Technical proficiency is positively associated with citizen satisfaction

H3: Project Planning and Execution is positively associated with Citizen Satisfaction Services in Abu Dhabi Police

H4: Corporate Culture Mediate the Relationship between Operational Excellence and Citizen Satisfaction services in Abu Dhabi Police

	Table	8 H	lypo	thesis	testing
--	-------	-----	------	--------	---------

Hypotheses	Path	Beta	T- Statistics	P Values	Decision
H1	LS -> CS	0.653	6.773	0.000	Supported
H2	TP -> CS	0.086	1.106	0.269	Not Supporte d
H3	PPE -> CS	0.079	1.919	0.006	Supported
H4	OE -> CS	0.111	2.035	0.042	Supported

As revealed by the result, Leadership Support positively significantly affect Citizen Satisfaction (β =.653, t=6.773, p< .050). These findings are consistent with the findings from other studies conducted across the countries (Favero& Meier, 2013). A more recent study, approach argues that citizens' unconscious biases in the assessment of public performance will lead to biased satisfaction evaluations (Hjortskov 2016; Marvel 2016, 2015). Behavioral accounts, such as the expectations-disconfirmation paradigm add individuals' expectations with a given service to the equation (Mok, James and Van Ryzin 2017).

In respect of Technical proficiency, the result revealed that it has significantly negative effect on Citizen Satisfaction (β =-.0.086, t=1.106, p>0.05). However, the finding of this study contradicts many studies conducted in developed countries (Moorthy, 2019). As discussed by Park et al., (2019), user satisfaction can also be understood as a situation whereby the users can feel the difference between the actual and expected benefits. Previous studies have shown that satisfaction is an important indicator of information system success. Since technical proficiency has not been discussed extensively in the literature, we are relying to the almost similar concept namely digital fluency. According to Myers &Sundaram (2017) digital fluency is the ability to reformulate knowledge and produce information to express oneself creatively and appropriately in a digital environment.

The results also showed that Project Planning and Execution has a significant positive impact on the Citizen Satisfaction (β =.079, t=1.919, p< .050). These findings are consistent with other empirical findings that Project Planning and Execution can stimulate Citizen Satisfaction by pursuing new technological ways in the police departments and service providing (David, H., Dorn, et.al., 2013). Generalizing the performance management of organizations such as police force with the notion 'one-size-fits-all' seems to ignore that police service represents a particular geographic area with an independent leadership (Barton, Ramahi, &Tansley, 2016). Abu Dhabi Police (ADP) is a typical example of how the police service has adopted strategic management which aimed at fostering effectiveness in service delivery to the public. Being the capital city of UAE, Abu Dhabi is not only an economic but also an administrative city where all key government agencies are

located. As such the city needs improved security due to the sensitive nature of the services offered in the city (Orr, Dopsaj, 2018A).

In respect of Corporate Culture Mediating the relationship between Operational Excellence and Citizen Satisfaction services the result revealed that it has significantly positively affected (β =-0.111, t=2.035, p>0.05). However, the finding of this study are also in lines with many studies conducted in developed countries (Kumar and Khair, 2018). The research by Shehu and Faisal (2016) with the title influence of corporate culture on the relationship between operational excellence and citizen satisfaction, they employed quantitative methodology in their research and they collect data from 211 respondents, they used SPSS and AMOS for their analysis, their findings show a significant influence of corporate culture on the relationship between operation. Similarly, Karyan and Ranjed (2015) conducted a research in India to investigate the influence of corporate culture on the operational excellence of police, their findings show that, corporate culture significantly influence the operational excellence of police in India.

14. Research Contribution

The Abu Dhabi Police deploys a service strategy created through strategic initiatives related to customer service and the customers' service, demonstrated by having front-line service employees deal with dissatisfied customers respectfully through greeting, smiling, and apologizing. The Abu Dhabi Police could overcome the barriers presented by the UAE's multicultural society and the nature of the service through having clear customer segmentation as part of the service strategy. As previously discussed in the literature review chapter, a segmentation of an Abu Dhabi Police's customers allows for a better knowledge of customers; improves the services provided; identifies customer expectations; and elicits accurate customer feedback about the services provided, which, in turn, increases the effectiveness of service recovery and complaint-handling procedures within the organization. This helps to retain the public's goodwill, which is considered essential to providing police services to society.

Because the corporate culture of the UAE influences the culture of the Abu Dhabi Police, front-line service employees deal with dissatisfied customers respectfully through greeting, smiling, and apologizing. Therefore, Abu Dhabi Police should encourage the embodiment of these characteristics of the UAE's national culture, which have the potential to powerfully affect service recovery performance. Doing so helps to retain the public's goodwill, which is considered essential to providing police services to society

Introducing service recovery and complaint-handling procedures within the Abu Dhabi Police did not encourage enough changes in the field (policing in Abu Dhabi). Consequently, some police social structure characteristics (such as hierarchy, bureaucracy, rankings, centralization, and paramilitaries) affect the frontline service employees' service recovery performance. The Abu Dhabi Police might focus on mitigating these effects, which would be a great starting point for future research.

Furthermore, this model can be applying to Abu Dhabi police under the responsibility of the police sector to ensure that it operates effectively and efficiently, it cooperates with local, national and international organizations to ensure the enforcement of laws in the latter safeguard public safety and maintain law and order (Molitoris, 2019).

Other than that, this study proposes a framework that allows to improve security outfit precisely police and provide guidance in addressing risk using a structured approach. The contribution of this research is to clarify two aspects which are the theoretical contribution and practical managerial contribution.

15. Conclusion

This study importance of proposing organizational excellence framework towards Abu Dhabi Police Department organizational excellence at Abu Dhabi Police Department. This study is therefore worth undertaking because the findings of this study can help raise awareness amongst the police force of the need for developing organizational excellence capabilities.

It will become more successful to creating corporate culture and incorporating organizational excellence and citizen satisfaction at Abu Dhabi Police Department. The study findings will make a valuable addition to the knowledge that has been acquired from other studies on organizational, and may help other individuals who might wish to undertake further studies and be useful for different organizations to develop organizational excellence

Researcher choose Abu Dhabi Police institution as a study area as the organization is the largest in UAE that has jurisdiction in terms of administration and law enforcement in the country. Through addressing organizational learning preparation and achievement, this research develops an effective organizational learning framework towards organizational excellence in Abu Dhabi Police Department and this framework can be used by other police sector in UAE to achieve the excellence performance.

References

- Akbar, F., Khan, R. A., Wadood, F., & Bin Bon, A. T. (2020). Entrepreneurial orientation dimension affects firm performance: A perspective from the Malaysian furniture industry. Entrepreneurial Business and Economics Review, 8(4), 157-181.
- McLean, R. S., Antony, J., &Dahlgaard, J. J. (2017). Failure of Continuous Improvement initiatives in manufacturing environments: a systematic review of the evidence. Total Quality Management & Business Excellence, 28(3-4), 219-237.
- Jaeger, A., &Matyas, K. (2016). Transformation of the EFQM approach from business towards operations excellence. *Production Engineering*, *10*(3), 277-291.
- Fok-Yew, O. (2018). The mediating effect of lean's soft factors on lean's hard factors and operational excellence in Malaysia manufacturing companies. *International Journal of Business Marketing & Management (IJBMM)*, *3*(1).
- Fok-Yew, O., & Ahmad, H. (2017). The effect of change management on operational excellence in electrical and electronics industry: Evidence from Malaysia. *Fundamental and Applied Studies in EU and CIS Countries*, 273.
- F Akbar, ATB Bon, ME Alshaikh, F Wadood (2021). Mediating effects of Inbound Open Innovation on Entrepreneurial Orientation and Firm Performance. Review of International Geographical Education Online 11 (5), 519-541.

- Al Shobaki, M. J., & Abu-Naser, S. S. (2017). The Role of the Practice of Excellence Strategies in Education to Achieve Sustainable Competitive Advantage to Institutions of Higher Education-Faculty of Engineering and Information Technology at Al-Azhar University in Gaza a Model.
- Khairi, H. M. (2016). Investigating the Needs for Designing English for Special Purposes Training Course for Field Staff in Abu Dhabi Police General Headquarter.
- Soares, A., Soltani, E., & Liao, Y. Y. (2017). The influence of supply chain quality management practices on quality performance: an empirical investigation. Supply Chain Management: An International Journal.
- Vaddeswaram, G. D. (2018). OPERATIONAL EXCELLENCE IN PHARMACEUTICALS–A PROCESS BASED APPROACH IN PANTOPRAZOLE SODIUM EC PELLETS 20% W/W (PFI) BY USING MANAGERIAL TECHNIQUES. Int J Pharma Bio Sci, 9(3), 89-98.
- Cojocaru, L., Falaris, E. M., Hoffman, S. D., & Miller, J. B. (2016). Financial system development and economic growth in transition economies: New empirical evidence from the CEE and CIS countries. Emerging Markets Finance and Trade, 52(1), 223-236.
- Tornjanski, V., Marinkovic, S., & Jancic, Z. (2017). Towards sustainability: Effective operations strategies, quality management and operational excellence in banking. *Amfiteatru Economic*, *19*(44), 79.
- Locke, E. A., Sirota, D., & Wolfson, A. D. (1976). An experimental case study of the successes and failures of job enrichment in a government agency. Journal of Applied Psychology, 61(6), 701.
- Spector, P. E. (1997). Job satisfaction: Application, assessment, causes, and consequences (Vol. 3). Sage.
- Rainey, H. G. (2008). Leadership and public service motivation in US federal agencies. International public management journal, 11(1), 109-142.
- Howes, L. M., & Goodman-Delahunty, J. (2014). Life course research design: Exploring career change experiences of former school teachers and police officers. Journal of Career Development, 41(1), 62-84.
- Abdulla, J., Djebarni, R., & Mellahi, K. (2011). Determinants of job satisfaction in the UAE: A case study of the Dubai police. Personnel review.
- Taylor, J., & Westover, J. H. (2011). Job satisfaction in the public service: The effects of public service motivation, workplace attributes and work relations. Public Management Review, 13(5), 731-751.
- Kim, W. G., & Park, S. A. (2017). Social media review rating versus traditional customer satisfaction. *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*.
- Dantzker, M. L., &Surrette, M. A. (1996). The perceived levels of job satisfaction among police officers: A descriptive review. Journal of Police and Criminal Psychology, 11(2), 7-12.
- White, S. (2010). Galaxy formation and evolution. Cambridge University Press.
- Brown, T. A., & Moore, M. T. (2012). Confirmatory factor analysis. *Handbook of structural equation modeling*, 361-379.
- de Waal, A. A. (2013). Evergreens of excellence. Journal of Management History.
- Jerez-Gómez, P., Céspedes-Lorente, J., & Perez-Valls, M. (2019). Do high-performance human resource practices work? The mediating role of organizational learning capability. Journal of Management & Organization, 25(2), 189-210.
- Ouma, S. O., K'Obonyo, P., &Yabs, J. (2017). The Role of Competitive Strategies in the Relationship Between Organizational Learning And Performance of Insurance Firms in Kenya. International Journal of Scientific Research and Management (IJSRM), 5(07), 5775-5799.
- Barney, J. (1991). Competitive Advantage. Journal of management, 17(1), 99-120.
- Bechtoldt, M. N. (2015). Wanted: self-doubting employees—Managers scoring positively on impostorism favor insecure employees in task delegation. *Personality and Individual Differences*, *86*, 482-486.
- Grant, R. M. (1991). The resource-based theory of competitive advantage: implications for strategy formulation. California management review, 33(3), 114-135.

- Grant, R. M. (1996). Toward a knowledge-based theory of the firm. Strategic management journal, 17(S2), 109-122.
- Hoskisson, R. E., Wan, W. P., Yiu, D., &Hitt, M. A. (1999). Theory and research in strategic management: Swings of a pendulum. Journal of management, 25(3), 417-456.
- Choo, C. W., &Bontis, N. (Eds.). (2002). The strategic management of intellectual capital and organizational knowledge. Oxford University Press on Demand.
- Chung, M., Ko, E., Joung, H., & Kim, S. J. (2018). Chatbot e-service and customer satisfaction regarding luxury brands. *Journal of Business Research*.
- Cojocaru, L., Falaris, E. M., Hoffman, S. D., & Miller, J. B. (2016). Financial system development and economic growth in transition economies: New empirical evidence from the CEE and CIS countries. Emerging Markets Finance and Trade, 52(1), 223-236.
- Conner, K. R. (1991). A historical comparison of resource-based theory and five schools of thought within industrial organization economics: do we have a new theory of the firm?. Journal of management, 17(1), 121-154.
- Creswell, J. W. (2003). Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches.
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). A concise introduction to mixed methods research. SAGE publications.
- Crossan, M. M., Maurer, C. C., & White, R. E. (2011). Reflections on the 2009 AMR decade award: do we have a theory of organizational learning?. Academy of management Review, 36(3), 446-460.
- Hair, J. F., Ringle, C. M., &Sarstedt, M. (2011). PLS-SEM: Indeed a silver bullet. Journal of Marketing theory and Practice, 19(2), 139-152.